



Naqd al-sanad-naqd al-matan a study on academic papers of master's degree students of the Hadith Sciences Department at the Graduate Program of UIN Alauddin Makassar

Muhammad Yahya¹, Darsul S. Puyu², & Muhammad Diyaul Haq³

^{1,2,3}Postgraduate Program, Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar

Correspondence Email: Yahya_uinmks@yahoo.co.id

ABSTRACT

This research aims to explore information related to students' proficiency in Naqd al-hadis through documented and published academic writings. The principles of naqd sanad encompass fundamental principles, namely: 1) 'Adalah (Justice), 2) Ittishal (Continuity), 3) Kedhabitan (Strong memorization and intelligence), 4) No zadz (Not awkward), and 5) No illat (Not problematic). Meanwhile, the fundamental principles related to the authenticity of hadith text include: 1) Not conflicting with the Quran, 2) Not conflicting with stronger hadith, 3) Not conflicting with common sense and the advancement of knowledge, 4) Not ambiguous (sadz), and 5) Not problematic (No illat). The subsidiary principle of the sanad revolves around the issue of the bid'a (innovation) of the narrator. Meanwhile, in the criticism of the Matan (content), apart from what has been mentioned in the previous fundamental principle, one must consider several factors, namely: a) The existence of the transmission of hadith through bil-makna (meaning-based transmission). b) Utilizing multiple approaches as references. c) Carefully examine the hadith's asbab a-wurud (context and circumstances of revelation). d) The presence of instructive content in the hadith related to matters with a "supra-rational" dimension. A student's proficiency in the critique of hadith encompasses the following key aspects: 1) adept application of various methods of hadith takhrij, 2) capability to classify hadiths resulting from takhrij, 3) competence in i'tibar and the creation of sanad schemata, 4) ability to examine and describe the assessments made by experts in the critique of hadith regarding narrators; 5) capacity to articulate and summarize the criteria for the authenticity of a hadith's sanad, 6) proficiency in analyzing both the literal and contextual aspects of hadith narration, 7) ability to convey variations in the interpretation of hadith texts, and 8) skill in drawing conclusions concerning a hadith from both its chain of transmission and content. The ability of postgraduate (Master's level) students majoring in Hadith Studies to engage in the critical analysis of hadith (naqd al-hadis) is generally at an excellent

level. Two significant factors contribute to students' proficiency in conducting such analysis: firstly, most of these students have an undergraduate background in Hadith Studies (undergraduate prom of Hadits Department)), and secondly, their foundational Arabic language skills are highly adequate.

Keywords: Naqd; sanad; matan

1. INTRODUCTION

The ability of alums to implement the method of hadith criticism (Naqd al-sanad and Naqd al-matan) serves as a benchmark for the success of alum development in enhancing their competencies in the study of meaningful sources, extracting evidence from original sources. Consequently, their findings, apart from being suitable for in-depth examination, also become points of reference. Original sources are believed to guide the community towards progress, advancement, and the building of civilization. Conversely, if evidence is revealed as a mere hoax that has transformed the community, it can become a basis for justification. Through diligent and profound study, the actual authenticity of evidence can be rediscovered.

One of these areas of study is the science of hadith, which, besides focusing on the content or message within a hadith, also encompasses information regarding the circumstances of narrators as part of the process of transmitting hadith. In accordance with its structure, the science of hadith consists of two main components, namely the sanad¹ (the chain of transmission originating from the Companion to the collector) and the Matan ²(the content or material of the hadith). These two elements must always be intertwined.

As a historical account transmitted by narrators across generations, Hadith spans epochs and is rooted in the past. Consequently, the role of external criticism of the chain of transmission (naqd al-khariji) and internal criticism of the content (naqd al-dakhili) becomes pivotal in evaluating the validity of the chain of transmission and the authenticity of the hadith text.

¹ The term *sanad* signifies a support system, as it relies on the dependency of each narrator upon the preceding one. This process initiates with the *mukharrij*, who anchors their narration to their teacher, and so forth, tracing back the transmission of hadiths to their origin, when the companion initially conveyed them. (Read 'ajaj al-khatib, *usul al-Hadis, 'Ulumuhu wa Mustalahuhu*, (Beirut : Dar al-fikr, 1981), p. 283 In terms of terminology, Al-Badr bin Jam'ah and Al-Thibi assert that Sanad refers to the narration concerning the content of the matan (text) of a hadith. (Mahmud Thahhan, *Taisir Mustalah al-Hadis*, (Beirut : Darh al-Qur'an al-Karim, 1979/M.1399 h.), h.15.

² Matan is construed as the terminus of the chain of narration, a focal point that garners attention. It is also construed as the "editorial content of the hadith," comprising the expressions within which specific meanings are encapsulated. (Authors)

The attribution of a hadith to the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) must undergo a diagnostic process to ensure its authenticity as originating from the Prophet. Recognizing the authenticity of a hadith serves as a standard or initial step, determining the necessity for rigorous efforts in both the chain of narration (*sanad*) and the content (*matn*) studies within various scholarly inquiries. The evolution of the principles of critiquing and studying the *isnad* (chain of transmission) and *matn* (content) has carved out its historical trajectory within the development of hadith studies. This evolution has given rise to numerous scholars who have contributed to refining more scientific and intricate methodologies through pioneering efforts, reviews, revisions, and advancements. The critique of the hadith text, or "Naqd al-matan hadis," involves examining the content of the hadith from various perspectives. This examination encompasses linguistic aspects, its relevance to the Quran, its non-overlapping nature with more *mutawatir* hadith, its alignment with sound reasoning, scientific progress, and its portrayal as the words of prophethood. In the contemporary Indonesian context, the principles related to the critique of the chain of transmission (*naqd al-sanad*) and the critique of the text (*naqd al-matan*) have been refined. This refinement process was initiated through the formulation by Syuhudi Ismail of its major and minor principles. Nevertheless, ongoing research and analysis by hadith experts and scholars continue to contribute to further developing these principles.

In Islamic higher education institutions, particularly within Islamic Studies, the principles of *isnad* (chain of transmission) and *matan* (content) constitute compulsory subjects in the curriculum for graduate students pursuing a Master's degree in Hadith Studies at the postgraduate level. Consequently, the principles of critiquing *isnad* and *matan* serve as focal points of scholarly investigation in academic works encompassing articles in academic journals, research papers, and theses. These principles are integral to the primary content and the analytical methodologies employed in these academic endeavors.

The academic writings produced by students reflect their mastery and application of the principles of *naqd al-sanad* (the criticism of the chain of narrators) and *naqd al-matan* (the criticism of the content). Among these, a thesis stands out as a monumental scholarly work. Therefore, it is imperative to scrutinize it in terms of mastering these principles and applying the methods of criticizing the *isnad* and the *matan*. This scrutiny should delineate the proficiency and success level achieved after undergoing the guidance process provided by the primary advisor and co-advisors and the evaluation conducted by the examination committee.

2. METHODS

Research Design and Research Settings

The research approach employed in this study is the qualitative descriptive method known as Library Research, which entails collecting data and information through direct observation of scholarly works produced by postgraduate students in the Hadith Science

department at UIN Alauddin Makassar. This qualitative descriptive research method provides an overview of students' proficiency in conducting naqd al-hadith (critical analysis of hadith) through their written works.

Research Focus

This research is focused on well-documented academic writings, both meticulously organized and stored in the library and those published through online journals or repositories at the UIN Alauddin Makassar Library.

Kind and Source of Data

Data used in this research were qualitative data, categorized data descriptively. Primary data is obtained from academic writings of graduate hadeeth science department students at UIN Alauddin Makassar, such as documents and references regarding this research.

Data collecting method

Methods in collecting data in this research as follows:

Observation

Observations are derived from documentary forms, whereby the researcher directly engages with the research subject.

Documentation

The documentation comprises theses and student thesis files from the library and journal websites.

Research Instruments

The research instruments are tools for data collection. The instruments utilized for this study comprise:

- a. Instruments in notebooks and writing utensils are employed to record all acquired data of the state of postgraduate alumni theses in Hadith Studies at the S2 level.
- b. Documentation encompasses recorded events in written records or archives stored in the Postgraduate Library of UIN Alauddin during the research.

Data Analysis

After all data has been gathered and compiled, the subsequent step involves data analysis. In qualitative research, the collected data is analyzed continuously and inductively throughout the course of the study by processing empirical materials. This

process is undertaken to simplify the data into a format that is more accessible, comprehensible, and interpretable.

In this research, data analysis was conducted after data collection. Subsequently, a qualitative analysis was carried out utilizing an inductive pattern, which involved drawing conclusions based on specific knowledge to assess phenomena of a general nature, synthesizing scientific facts from various meticulously selected sources, culminating in the production of a qualitative written work in the form of a literary research endeavor. The subject of investigation is the academic writings of postgraduate students pursuing a Master's program in Hadith Studies at the Graduate School of UIN Alauddin Makassar, specifically within the realm of *Naqd al-hadith*. This bibliographically oriented researcher explores the methodological competence within research theses authored by students enrolled in the Hadith Studies program at UIN Alauddin Makassar, spanning 2018-2019.

The methodology entails content analysis by applying the principles of critical examination of the chain of narrators (*sanad*) and the text (*Matan*) of hadith as analytical tools. The principles of *naqd al-sanad* (critique of the chain of narrators) and *naqd al-matan* (critique of the text), as elucidated in the preceding section, serve as instruments for assessing the quality of a hadith, and they should ideally be explicitly delineated and applied in scholarly works such as research papers and theses.

The student theses intended to complement the research are pursued by accessing the library data resources at the Postgraduate Program of UIN Alauddin Makassar, utilizing both computer-assisted and manual methods. The thesis selection criteria involve categorizing research titles that encompass topics related to 'Hadith Quality' or 'Maudhu'i/Thematic Studies,' wherein both necessitate the application of the principles of *Sanad* and *Matan* criticism as integral components of the research methodology.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Ability in *Naqd Sanad*

From a scholarly standpoint, one can delineate the proficiency of postgraduate students enrolled in the Master's Program in Hadith Studies at UIN Alauddin Makassar in applying the method of hadith authenticity in conducting criticism, as explicated below:

Naqd Sanad of Ansharullah' Thesis:

This thesis has successfully undertaken the task of *takhrij al-hadis*, utilizing the *Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*, *Kunus al-Sunnah*, accessed through CD Room applications, particularly *Maktabah Syamilah* and *Mausu'ah kitab Tis'ah*. The terms employed for data retrieval from the *Mu'jam* are '*tsub*,' '*ariyat*,' and '*labasa*.' The author adequately performed this task when conducting the *l'tibar al-sanad* (evaluating the chain of narrators). However, it should be noted that the categorization of the hadith under investigation into *mutawatir* or *ahad* has not been definitively established. Furthermore, the research on the aspect of *sanad* continuity (*ittishal sanad*) of the presented hadiths,

based on the teacher-student relationship as an indication of continuity, has been initiated. Nonetheless, a specific examination of the aspects of 'liqa' (meeting) and 'mu'asharah' (social interaction) has not been undertaken.

Regarding the reliability of narrators, the author has successfully identified this through the evaluation and critical commentary on the sanad of hadiths, consistently attributing a '*shighat tahammul tsiqat*' rating to the narrators under scrutiny. Similarly, in the context of '*kedhabitan*' (truthfulness), this has been assessed primarily through the statements of critical sanad commentators, who have generally accorded a '*tsiqat*' rating to specific narrators.

However, it is worth noting that the thesis has not provided specific attention to the possibilities of '*syadz*' (mistake) and '*illat*' (hidden defect) within the *sanad*. This aspect remains unexplored in the work of Mr. Ansharullah in this thesis.

Naqd al-Sanad of Hasbullah's Thesis:

In his thesis, Mr. Hasbullah has also diligently conducted the hadith authentication process (*takhrij al-hadis*). He accomplished this by utilizing the reference work "*Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*" and cross-referencing it with digital resources such as the CD Room application, most notably the *Maktabah Syamilah* and *Mausu'ah kitab Tis'ah* databases. The terms employed for data retrieval from *Mu'jam* included "*zalzala*," "*rajfah*," "*khasafa*," "*faza'a*," and "*haraka*."

Furthermore, he has demonstrated proficiency in "*I'tibar al-sanad*" (assessment of the chain of narrators). However, it should be noted that the thesis does not definitively establish whether the hadith under investigation is of the "*mutawati'*" (mass-transmitted) or "*ahad*" (singularly transmitted) category in terms of quantitative classification.

In terms of the continuity of the *isnad* (*ittishal sanad*) of the presented hadiths, a thorough examination has been conducted to discern the indications of *isnad* continuity by observing the teacher-student relationships; however, the aspect of *liqa and mu'asharah* has not explicitly been elucidated. Regarding the aspect of the narrators' integrity, it has been successfully ascertained through the evaluation and commentary of hadith *isnads* by critics, who generally grant a *shighat tahammul tsiqat* rating to the narrators they investigate. Similarly, reliability has been assessed solely based on the statements of *isnad* critics who provide a *tsiqat* rating for certain narrators. Moreover, the aspect of the potential occurrence of *syadz* and *illat* in the *isnad* has not been highlighted explicitly in Hasbullah's thesis.

Naqd al-Sanad of Muktabir's Thesis:

This thesis has successfully undertaken the task of *takhrij al-hadis*, employing the *Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*, *Kunus al-Sunnah*, and utilizing CD Room applications, notably *the Maktabah Syamilah and Mausu'ah Tis'ah*. The terms utilized for data retrieval from the *Mu'jam* include "*ra'in*" and "*mas'uulun*." The hadith

verification process in this research is quite comprehensive, encompassing various approaches. It commences with a textual analysis, tracing through the words in the text, followed by an examination based on the initial letters, and culminating in an assessment of the hadith's degree or status. When considering the "*l'tibar al-sanad*" or the reliability of the chain of narrators, it is executed diligently, identifying narrators categorized as "*syahida*" and "*mutabi*," albeit without definitively determining whether the hadith under examination is mutawatir or *ahad*.

Additionally, this thesis delves into the aspect of sanad connectivity (*ittishal sanad*) in the presented hadiths, primarily by scrutinizing the indications of connectivity within the sanad through the presence of teacher-student relationships. It successfully elucidates the aspects of "*liqa*" and "*mu'asharah*" by conducting specific analyses, such as compiling the names of teachers and students mentioned, employing specific terms like "*Shighat tahammul*" to indicate whether these interactions were direct or indirect, and identifying the locations and periods during which they may have met.

From a perspective of justice, the narrator successfully identified several assessments and critical comments by hadith critics, which, on average, attributed a degree of reliability (*shighat tahammul*) to the narrators under examination. Similarly, regarding reliability, it is only assessed based on the statements of sanad critics attributing a reliable (*tsiqat*) status to specific narrators. *Muktabir* evaluates both closely related narrators as 'just' (*'adil*) and 'reliable' (*dhabit*) by considering several assessments made by hadith scholars. As for the possibility of occurrence of syadz and illat (anomalies and defects) in the chain of transmission (*sanad*), this specific aspect has not been explicitly addressed in *Muktabir*'s thesis.

Naqd al-Sanad pada Tesis Saudara Zulkifli:

This thesis has successfully undertaken the task of *takhrij al-hadith*, utilizing the *Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*, *Kunus al-Sunnah*, particularly through the CD Room applications, primarily *Maktabah Syamilah* and *Mausu'ah kitab Tis'ah*. The terms used to trace data from *Mu'jam* are limited to the concept of *hijrah* alone. In the process of *l'tibar al-sanad*, the author has executed this task proficiently, considering the presence of *syahid* and *mutabi*' elements. However, whether the hadith under investigation remains mutawatir or *ahad* in quantity remains uncertain. Regarding the hadiths narrated by al-Bukhari or Muslim, no further critique of their chains of transmission is provided, as al-Bukhari and Muslim have adequately established their authenticity.

The thesis has also researched the aspect of sanad continuity (*ittishal sanad*) for the presented hadiths by examining indicators of sanad continuity through the teacher-student relationship. However, specific analysis of the aspects of *liqa* and *mu'asharah* is yet to be explored. The justice (*adl*) aspect of narrators was successfully determined through the evaluation and comments of the chain critics, who generally bestowed the *shighat tahammul tsiqat* rating on the narrators they examined. Similarly, assessing the

reliability (*kedhabitan*) aspect was primarily based on the judgments of chain critics who assigned the *tsiqat* rating to specific narrators.

The aspects of potential occurrences of *syadz* (deviation) and *illat* (hidden defect) in the chain have not been specifically addressed within this thesis, as these aspects were not highlighted in Brother Zulkifli's research.

Naqd al-Sanad pada Tesis Saudara Yusuf Assegaf:

This thesis has effectively conducted the process of *takhrij al-hadith* by employing various scholarly sources. The researcher has adeptly utilized *Kitab Jami'al-Shaghir* while tracing the initial wording, alongside references to *Mausu'ah* by Zaqlul and Fathul al-Kabir. Additionally, the research draws upon *Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*, and references have been accessed through CD-ROM applications, particularly the *Maktabah Syamilah* and *Mausu'ah Tis'ah*. The specific terminologies used for data retrieval from *Mu'jam* include *al-shadar*, *al-qalb*, *al-fu'ad*, and *al-lubab*.

When examining the chain of transmission (*l'tibar al-sanad*), the author has performed diligently. It has been observed that there are witnesses (*syahid*) and reliable (*mutabi*) chains of transmission for the hadiths under consideration. However, whether the hadiths being investigated fall under the *mutawatir* (widely transmitted) or *ahad* (singularly transmitted) is yet to be confirmed.

From the perspective of the connectedness of the chains of transmission (*ittishal sanad*) of the presented hadiths, this is established through the existence of the teacher-student relationship (*hubungan guru-murid*). Some narrators' interactions, such as *liqa and mu'asharah* (encounters and social interactions), have been briefly elucidated, particularly during their travels in various regions.

Regarding the aspect of the narrators' integrity, it has been successfully determined through the evaluation and critical comments of the chain of transmission by critics who, on average, assign a high degree of reliability (*tsiqat*) and trustworthiness (*shighat*) to the narrators they have investigated. This is often accompanied by a designation of *wara* (piety). As for the aspect of precision in narration (*kedhabitan*), it is primarily assessed based on the assessments of the chain of transmission critics, who generally bestow the designation of *tsiqat* upon specific narrators.

However, it is worth noting that the possibility of errors (*syadz*) and hidden defects (*illat*) within the chain of transmission has not been highlighted explicitly in Brother Ansharullah's thesis.

Naqd al-Sanad pada Tesis Saudara Riska:

This thesis primarily focuses on the *takhrij al-hadith* methodology, utilizing the book "*Mu'jam al-Mufahras lil Alfadz al-Hadis al-Nabawi*" for this purpose. The terms employed for data retrieval from the *Mu'jam* are limited to the term "*hay*." In the process of *l'tibar*

al-sanad, the author pays particular attention to narrators with the status of syahid and mutabi' without definitively establishing whether the hadith under examination falls into the category of mutawatir or ahad. Furthermore, this thesis researches the sanad (ittishal sanad) continuity of the presented hadiths by examining indications of sanad continuity through teacher-student relationships. However, it has not yet provided a specific analysis of the aspects of liqa and mu'asharah. In terms of the narrators' integrity, this study identifies indicators of their trustworthiness through assessments and critical comments on the sanad, with most critics assigning qualifications such as shaduq, hujjah, and tsiqat to the narrators in question. Similarly, when evaluating the narrators' expertise (kedhabitan), the analysis relies on statements made by critics of the sanad who have granted the qualification tsiqat to specific narrators or mentioned terms such as hafidz, mutqin, faqih, and others.

Table 1. Recapitulation of Research Results on the Application of Sanad Hadith Validity Methods in Hadith Science Study Program Alumni Theses

| No | Authors | Takhrij Al-Hadis | I'tibar al-Sanad | Application of the Sanad Criticism method | | | | |
|----|---------------|------------------|------------------|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | A | B | C | D | E |
| 1. | Ansharullah | y | y | y | y | y | — | — |
| 2. | Hasbullah | y | y | y | y | y | — | — |
| 3. | Muktabir | y | y | y | y | y | — | — |
| 4. | Zulkifli | y | y | y | y | y | — | — |
| 5. | Yusuf Assegaf | y | y | y | y | y | - | — |
| 6. | Riska | y | y | y | y | y | — | - |

Description:

- A= Kaedah Ittishal al-Sanad
- B= Kaedah Keadilan Periwiyat
- C= Kaedah Kedhabitan Periwiyat
- D= Kaedah terhindar dari Syadz
- E= Kaedah tidak terdapat illat

Analysis of Naqd Matan Ability in Hadith Science Study Program Students' Theses

As students or alumni of the Hadith Studies program, they have undoubtedly acquired proficiency in the methods pertaining to the textual criticism of Hadith, which serves as an indicator for the authenticity of a Hadith, considering both its chain of transmission (isnad) and the content (matn). The method applied to gauge the authenticity of the content of a Hadith primarily focuses on assessing the presence of any anomalies (shadhhdh) and identifying underlying weaknesses (illat) within the transmitted text.

Subsequently, the findings of this research are reported concerning the application of the Hadith authenticity assessment method from the perspective of textual criticism.

Several theses authored by students or alumni of the Hadith Studies program are presented as follows:

Naqd al-Matan on Ansharullah's Thesis:

Regarding textual criticism of the hadiths utilized by Mr. Ansharullah in his thesis, it is noted that this thesis has not comprehensively examined the criteria for the authenticity of the hadith texts under study. Mr. Ansharullah's thesis has not sufficiently delineated the potential presence of hadiths within his purview that may exhibit variations or anomalies in their transmission history. Furthermore, beyond the criteria concerning the credibility of the hadith text, the analysis presented merely asserts that the hadiths in question do not contradict the verses of the Quran. However, there is no effort made to establish their compatibility with other Quranic verses, nor is there any mention of the potential for discrepancies with other authentic hadiths, historical facts, rationality, linguistic principles, or any narrative alterations within the prophetic tradition. Mr. Ansharullah does not offer an analysis from the perspective of potential anomalies (*illat*) in the hadiths, whether in their linguistic or substantive aspects, which might give rise to variations in transmission status, such as *ziyadah*, *idraj*, *nuqsan*, *inqilab*, *tashrif*, *tahrif*, and other such categories.

Naqd al-Matan on Hasbullah's Thesis:

In criticism of the hadiths utilized by Mr. Hasbullah in his thesis, it is noted that this thesis has not comprehensively considered the principles of the authenticity of the hadith texts that they have studied. Mr. Hasbullah's thesis has not elaborated on the possibility that the hadiths under examination may possess variations in their transmission, either in wording (*riwayat syadz*) or in meaning (*berillat*). Furthermore, there is no discussion regarding the potential harmonization of these hadiths with verses from the Quran or other authentic hadiths. There is a lack of effort to establish the relevance of these hadiths to other Quranic verses, and there is no mention of the possibility of contradiction with other authentic hadiths. The thesis also does not address the potential contradiction with historical facts, rationality, linguistic principles, or inconsistencies within the prophetic narratives. Analysis of the likelihood of the presence of *illat* (causes for variation) is also conspicuously absent from Mr. Hasbullah's work, whether it pertains to linguistic or semantic forms that could lead to variations in the status of the hadiths, such as *ziyadah* (additions), *idraj* (addition of words), *nuqsan* (omissions), *inqilab* (transformation), *tashrif* (elevation), *tahrif* (alteration), and other possibilities.

Naqd al-Matan on Muktabir Thesis:

In terms of textual criticism applied to the hadiths utilized by Mr. Muktabir in his thesis, it is evident that this thesis demonstrates the application of the principles of hadith authenticity that the author has studied. Mr. Muktabir's thesis meticulously examines the possibility that the hadiths under investigation possess either a *syadz* (anomalous) or *berillat* (problematic) chain of transmission. From the perspective of *syadz* criteria, it is argued that these hadiths do not contradict the verses of the Quran. Efforts are made to

establish their relevance to other Quranic verses, and no evidence is presented indicating potential conflicts with other authenticated hadiths, historical facts, logical reasoning, linguistic principles, or any narrative distortions as part of prophetic traditions. Consequently, Mr. Muktabir concludes that these hadiths do not contain any syadz elements. Furthermore, an analysis concerning the possibility of illat (hidden defects) has also been put forth by Mr. Muktabir, examining both lafdzi (verbal) and maknawi (meaning-based) forms that could potentially lead to variations in the hadith transmission, such as ziyadah (addition), idraj (insertion), nuqsan (omission), inqilab (alteration), tashrif (elevation), tahrif (corruption), among others. However, Mr. Muktabir's ultimate conclusion is that these hadiths' matan (textual content) exhibit no illat components.

Naqd al-Matan on Zulkifli Thesis:

In terms of textual criticism of the hadiths used by Mr. Zulkifli in his thesis, it can be observed that this thesis has not thoroughly examined the criteria for the authenticity of the hadith narrations they studied. Mr. Zulkifli's thesis has not provided a detailed analysis of the possibility that the hadiths under investigation may be fabricated or contain irregularities. The criteria for assessing the authenticity of hadiths, such as their consistency with the Quranic verses, alignment with well-established authentic hadiths, and relevance, have not been systematically addressed. Furthermore, there is no attempt to establish their compatibility with other Quranic verses, nor is there an exploration of their potential inconsistencies with historical facts, logical reasoning, linguistic principles, or narrative coherence within the prophetic tradition.

Naqd al-Matan on Yusuf Assegaf Thesis:

Regarding textual criticism concerning the hadiths utilized by Mr. Ansharullah in his thesis, it can be observed that this thesis has not comprehensively examined the criteria for assessing the authenticity of the hadith texts they have studied. Mr. Yusuf Assegaf's thesis does not provide a detailed analysis of the possibility that the hadiths under investigation may have a "riwayat" (narration) deemed questionable or flawed. The aspect of the methodology of the reliability of the hadith texts is introduced by verifying that these hadiths do not contradict the verses of the Quran. Furthermore, the thesis establishes their compatibility with other authentic hadiths and subsequently incorporates supportive narrations. The analysis also extends to historical facts and logical reasoning. The examination of the potential existence of "illat" (hidden defects) in these hadiths is discussed by Mr. Yusuf, whether they manifest in the form of discrepancies in the wording or in the intended meanings, which might lead to variations in the narration's status, such as "ziyadah" (addition), "idraj" (interpolation), "taghyir" (alteration), "nuqshan" (omission), or "inqilab" (shift). Nevertheless, Mr. Yusuf concludes that the hadiths in question do not contain hidden defects; instead, the observed variances indicate differences in the transmitted meanings.

Naqd al-Matan Riska Thesis:

In terms of textual criticism applied to the hadiths utilized by Ms. Riska in her thesis, it is notable that the thesis does not provide a comprehensive examination of the criteria for the authenticity of the hadith texts they have studied. Ms. Riska's thesis does not delve into the possibility that the hadiths under scrutiny may possess a "riwayat" that is syadz (aberrant) or berillat (suspect). Most cited hadiths predominantly pertain to narrations by meaning (periwayatan bil makna). The thesis identifies various textual variations within the hadiths, resulting in instances of inqilab (alteration), ziyadah (addition), idraj (interpolation), and nuqshan (omission).

From the perspective of syadz methodology, the thesis merely asserts that these hadiths do not contradict the verses of the Quran, do not conflict with other authenticated hadiths, and do not contravene historical facts. However, the thesis does not diligently explore the relevance of these hadiths to other Quranic verses, nor does it report the potential contradictions with other authenticated hadiths, the principles of sound reasoning, linguistic criteria, or any narrative incongruities within the prophetic tradition.

Table 2. Recapitulation of Research Findings on the Application of the Methodology of Hadith Textual Authenticity in the Theses of Hadith Studies Department

| No | Research writers | Application of Matan Criticism | | | | | | | |
|----|------------------|--------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | A | B | C | D | E | F | G | H |
| 1. | Ansharullah | y | y | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| 2. | Hasbullah | y | y | y | - | - | - | - | - |
| 3. | Muktabir | y | y | y | y | y | y | - | - |
| 4. | Zulkifli | y | y | y | y | - | y | - | - |
| 5. | Yusuf Assegaf | y | y | y | y | y | y | - | - |
| 6. | Riska | y | y | y | y | - | y | - | - |

Description:

A = Not contradictory B = Not indicative C = In accordance with the Quran D = In accordance with authentic Hadith E = In line with logical reasoning F = Consistent with historical facts G = In accordance with linguistic principles H = In accordance with prophetic sayings

4) Avoid zadz (Not awkward), and 5) Avoid illat (Not problematic). Meanwhile, the fundamental principles related to the authenticity of hadith text include: 1) Not conflicting with the Quran, 2) Not conflicting with stronger hadith, 3) Not conflicting with common sense and the advancement of knowledge, 4) Not ambiguous (sadz), and 5) Not problematic (ovoid Illat). 1) Not conflicting with the Quran, 2) Not conflicting with stronger hadith, 3) Not conflicting with common sense and the advancement of knowledge, 4) Not ambiguous (sadz), and 5) Not problematic (Avoid illat).

Therefore, it can be asserted that, on the whole, the critique process (naqd) is evident in thesis writing; however, applying the method of naqd al-matan must be improved. Two

fundamental components, namely sanad (chain of narrators) and *Matan* (textual content), are the central focus of hadith research. When the evaluation of the sanad of a hadith is not carried out concerning its attribution as *marfu* (traceable back to the Prophet), *mauquf* (traceable back to a companion), or *maqtu'* (traceable back to a successor), it essentially fails to provide confidence that a hadith is authentically attributed to the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him). Similarly, from a quantitative perspective, if it is not known whether a hadith is a *mutawatir* (mass-transmitted) or *ahad* (singularly transmitted), it becomes challenging to infer the quality of the *sanad*. A factor that hadith researchers cannot disregard is the quality of integrity and reliability (*kedhabitan*) of narrators. While all of the aforementioned thesis authors address the aspect of the narrator's integrity or credibility clearly, the dimension of their reliability is not elaborated upon in great detail.

Regarding content, some thesis writers have yet to receive adequate attention regarding this hadith. It is necessary to elucidate the synchronization between the message the hadith conveys and historical facts. Additionally, it is imperative to clarify its alignment with linguistic principles and conformity with the sayings of the Prophet.

REFERENCES

- Abd al-Wahhab Khallaf (1392 H/1972 M.) 'ilmu Ushul al-Fiqih.: Majlis al-A'la al Indonesiy al-Dakwah al-Islamiyah; Indonesia.
- Ahmad bin Muhammad al-Fayyumi (1398 H/1978 M) , al-Misbah al-Munir fi gharib al-syarh al-kabir li al-rafi'i, juz II, Dar al-kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, : Bairut.
- Baso Midong (2007), Kualitas Hadiis Dalam Kitab Tafsir al-Nur, karya Tengku.M. Hasbi ash-Shiddiqy. Cet. I, Yapma, Makassar.
- Benny Afwadzi (2011), Pemikiran G.H.A. Juiynboll Tentang Hadis Mutawatir, Jurnal Studi Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Quran dan Hadis, Volume 12.
- _____, (2017) Pergeseran dan Perkembangan Terma Mutawatir Dalam Studi Hadis, (Jurnal Islamuna Volume 4 no 2.
- Hasbi ash-Shiddiqi (1980), pokok-pokok ilmu dirayah hadis, jilid I, Bulan Bintang : Jakarta.
- Jalal al-Din 'abd al-Rahman bin Abi Bakr al-Suyuthiy (1979), Tadrib al-Rawi fi Syarh Taqrib al-Nawawi, Jilid I, Dar Ihya' al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyah; Bairut.
- Kamaruddin Amin, (2009) Menguji Kembali Keakuratan Metode kritik hadiis, (cet.I); : Hikmah, Jakarta.
- Muahmud al-Thahhan (1398 H/1978 M.), Ushul al-Takhrij wa Dirasat al-Asanid, al-Maktabah al-Arabiyah; Halb.
- _____, (1979 M/1398 H.), Taisir Mustalah al-Hadis, Darh al-Qur'an al-Karim; Bairut.

- M. Syuhudi Ismail (1998), *Metodologi Penelitian Hadis Nabi Saw.* Bulan Bintang; Jakarta.
- _____, (1991) *Pengantar Ilmu Hadis.* Angkasa; Bandung.
- Muhammad 'ajjaj al-khathib 1395 H/1975 M, *ushul al-hadist 'ulumuhu wa mushthalahuhu*, Bairut : Dar al-fikr; Bairut.
- Muhammad Al-Shabbag (1392 H/1972 M), *Hadis al-Nabawi, Mushtalahuhu, Balaghahu, 'ulumuhu wa kutubuhu*, t.tp : al-maktabah al-islamiyah, (t.tp.)
- Muhammad Qomarullah (2016), *Metode Takhrij Hadis Dalam Menakar Hadis Nabi saw*, STAI, *jurnal el-Ghiroh Vol.XI, No. 02 2016*; Lubuklinggau.
- Subhi al-Shalih (1977), *'Ulum al-Hadis wa Mushthalahuhu*; Dar al'Ilm li al-Malayin; Bairut.
- Tjut Ju Soendari (2012), *Metode Penelitian Deskriptif*, Bandung : UPI, Akademia; Bandung.
- Wiwin Yuliani (2018), *Metode Penelitian Deskriptif Kualitatif dalam Perspektif Bimbingan dan Konseling*; STKIP Jurnal Quanta; Siliwangi.